



**MINUTES OF THE UNIVERSITY OF LIVERPOOL COUNCIL**

**MEETING HELD ON 9 FEBRUARY 2023  
AT THE SPINE**

<b>Present:</b>	Carmel Booth, President (in the Chair); Dr Paul Johnson, Vice-President; Professor Tim Jones, Vice-Chancellor; Professor Gavin Brown, Pro-Vice-Chancellor for Education; Professor Anthony Hollander, Pro-Vice-Chancellor for Research and Impact; Dr Carol Costello, Director of People and Services; Cilla Ankrah-Lucas; Fiona Cullen; Dr Kashmir Gill; Vanessa Griffiths; Helen Miller; Dr Roger Platt; Hans van Mourik Broekman; Dr Diana Walford; Professor Julia Balogun; Professor Hazel Scott; Professor Thomas Teubner; and Kieran O’Sullivan.
<b>Apologies:</b>	Vasiliki Samuels, President of the Liverpool Guild of Students; Barry Flynn; and Kathryn Manley.
<b>In Attendance:</b>	Kevan Ryan, Clerk to Council/University Secretary and General Counsel; Nicola Davies, Chief Financial Officer; and Emma Leonard, Head of Governance and Deputy Secretary.

*Prior to the meeting, members received a presentation delivered by Professor Julia Balogun, Dean of the Management School, Brett Chair in Management and Professor of Strategic Management, on the recent progress of the Management School as it celebrates its 20<sup>th</sup> anniversary.*

**UNRESERVED BUSINESS**

**COMMITTEE AND MEMBERSHIP MATTERS**

**1. Student Engagement**

Council was joined by Amy Mook, a PhD student and Doctoral Academic Teacher, who talked to members about her experiences as a student at the University, in particular focussing on her educational journey, the challenges she has faced, the invaluable support provided by the University and her passion for helping others to succeed.

**2. Welcome**

Professor Tim Jones, Vice-Chancellor, was welcomed to his first Council meeting.

**3. Disclosures of Interest**

Members were asked to disclose any interest that could give rise to conflict in relation to any item on the agenda. No such interests were disclosed.

#### **4. Minutes of Previous Meetings**

##### **4.1 Unreserved Minutes of the Meeting Held on 24 November 2022**

###### **AGREED:**

- i. The unreserved minutes of the meeting held on 24 November 2022 should be approved as an accurate record.

#### **5. Report on Action Taken by the President on Behalf of Council and Business Dealt with Via Circulation**

###### **RECEIVED:**

- i. A report on action taken by the President on Council's behalf and business dealt with via circulation since the last business meeting.

###### **REPORTED:**

- ii. The President had taken Chair's action as follows:

Appendix A to the Student Complaints Policy and Procedures: Procedure for Student Complaints in the Event of Major Disruption (approved 28 November 2022)

To approve revisions to Appendix A to the Student Complaints Policy and Procedures which clarifies when complaints will go to the Major Disruption Panel.

Appointments to Committees (approved 9 January 2023 and 20 January 2023)

To approve a change to the Committee on Research Ethics' (CORE) constitution to provide for the Chair to be the Associate Pro-Vice-Chancellor for the Research Environment and Postgraduate Research. The change was proposed to move away from the Chair being a lay member appointed by the Council to the Chair being a senior University colleague as it was believed that: there were some clear disadvantages to a lay chair as many of the issues raised at CORE involved operations in Faculties; it would enable a pan-University perspective to research ethics to be taken and integration of the role of CORE with the other research governance processes; and it would also bring CORE in line with the practice of the other joint committees of the Council and Senate (Education Committee; Research and Impact Committee; and Research Integrity and Governance Committee), which were chaired by members of the executive team.

To approve the appointment of Norman Molyneux as an external adviser to the Enterprise Board for the period until 31 July 2025.

- iii. Since the last business meeting of Council, the following matters had been dealt with via email circulation to members:

Appointment of Our Next Chancellor (circulated 29 November 2022)

Members approved the recommendation of the Committee to Nominate a Chancellor that United States District Court Judge Wendy Beetlestone should be

proposed to the Privy Council as the next Chancellor of the University for a period of five years. Judge Beetlestone was the University's eleventh Chancellor and its first female, and first Black, Chancellor. She was an alumna, graduating with a BA (Hons) in Philosophy in 1984, and her outstanding professional achievements included being nominated by US President Barack Obama in 2014 to serve as a District Court Judge. In 2019, the University awarded her an honorary degree in recognition and celebration of her fearless commitment to fairness and justice throughout her career.

**AGREED:**

- iv. The action taken by the President on Council's behalf as outlined in 5ii above should be endorsed.

**ITEMS FOR APPROVAL/DISCUSSION/NOTE**

**6. President's Communications**

**RECEIVED:**

- i. An oral report from the President of Council.

**REPORTED:**

- ii. Saxton Bampfylde had been appointed to assist in the search for three new lay members of Council, a co-opted member of the Audit Committee and an independent member of the Remuneration Committee. The advert was live, with a closing date of 8 March 2023, and it stated that Council would benefit from members with knowledge and experience of audit/risk, research, ethics, innovation and enterprise, and industry/business. It would be much appreciated if members could promote these opportunities within their own networks.
- iii. Members were encouraged to put the following dates in their diaries:
  - July degree ceremonies: Monday 17 to Friday 21 July 2023
  - December degree ceremonies: Monday 11 and Tuesday 12 December 2023
  - Guild Awards: Thursday 11 May 2023
  - Staff Awards: Tuesday 11 July 2023 (the July Council meeting would be rescheduled from 2-5pm on Thursday 13 July to 1-4pm on Tuesday 11 July with a view to members attending the meeting and then going on to the Awards ceremony).

**7. Clerk to Council's Communications**

**RECEIVED:**

- i. An oral report from the Clerk to Council.

**REPORTED:**

- ii. The group litigation action seeking compensation for students in relation to a claim of disruption to studies caused by industrial action and the COVID-19

pandemic test case, involving UCL, had been postponed and was awaiting a revised court listing.

- iii. Whilst universities already had a requirement to uphold freedom of speech and academic freedom through existing law and the OfS public interest governance principles, new freedom of speech legislation currently going through parliament would enable the OfS to regulate the sector more closely on these matters. In response to this, the University was reviewing its current policy and processes and determining what action it needed to take. Council members would receive a more detailed briefing on this later this academic year.
- iv. The OfS had previously confirmed its intention to propose a new ongoing condition of registration which would place requirements on universities and colleges to address harassment and sexual misconduct. The OfS planned to consult on the proposed condition shortly. The University had previously responded to the OfS's Statement of Expectations to Prevent and Address Harassment and Sexual Misconduct by establishing an action plan which was overseen by the Health and Safety Governance Committee.
- v. The OfS had been subject to some negative feedback recently and as part of its response to this had published how it wished to refresh its engagement with the sector.
- vi. A useful Wonkhe article regarding university surpluses/reserves had been published and the link to this would be shared with members.
- vii. Half hour closed sessions for lay members would be scheduled in due course, to take place immediately before each business meeting of Council.

## **8. Vice-Chancellor's Communications**

### **RECEIVED:**

- i. A report from the Vice-Chancellor on University and sector wide news, covering:
  - The University's TEF Provider Submission
  - The appointment of the University's new Chancellor
  - An update on University and College Union strike action
  - The State of The Nation lecture for the Heseltine Institute delivered by Lord Michael Heseltine in December
  - A £3m Future Goals campaign by the city's football clubs, the University, the Steve Morgan Foundation and IntoUniversity
  - An update on the final phase of the Research in an Inclusive and Sustainable Environment (RISE) project
  - The launch of the University's Climate Plan towards the end of 2022
  - The UK Government's policy towards international students
  - Hardship support and maintenance uplift in England/All Party Parliamentary Group (APPG) for Students cost of living inquiry
  - Universities UK guidance on student suicide
  - Free Speech Bill

- The Government's autumn budget statement in late 2022, which had confirmed the commitment to spend £20bn on research and development funding.

**REPORTED:**

- ii. The cabinet reshuffle on 7 February 2023 announced the creation of a number of new departments of relevance to the sector. The Department for Energy Security and Net Zero would be headed up by the former Business Secretary Grant Shapps MP; former Universities Minister, Michelle Donelan MP, would lead the new Department for Science, Innovation and Technology, which would take over science and technology-focused activity previously managed by BEIS and the Department for Digital, Culture, Media, and Sport; a combined Department for Business and Trade would be led by Kemi Badenoch MP who would become Business and Trade Secretary and continue as Minister for Women and Equalities; and a re-focused Department for Culture, Media and Sport would have Lucy Frazer MP at the helm. The creation of a Department focused on science and research should be a positive move for the sector and for the University.
- iii. In relation to the impact of the cost of living crisis on students, the University's student hardship fund had been trebled from £0.5m to £1.5m and the process streamlined, and there had been a significant rise in applications. Other initiatives included: support for PGR students; bursary support; suspension of library fines; a food larder; student money coaches and advice; cheaper meals in the Guild; hot water and microwaves available in various outlets; subsidised local travel; and the provision of period products.

**9. Liverpool Guild of Students Report and Financial Statements for the Year Ended 31 July 2022**

**RECEIVED:**

- i. The Liverpool Guild of Students Report and Financial Statements for the Year Ended 31 July 2022.

**NOTED:**

- ii. The Guild Officers had decided that they would not be attending any University meetings as a way of standing in solidarity with the University and College Union which was engaged in industrial action on this date. The President and Deputy President of the Liverpool Guild of Students had therefore submitted their apologies for the meeting.

**10. Quarter 1 and Forecast 1 Performance Report**

**RECEIVED:**

- i. The Q1 and FC1 performance report, which provided details of how the institution had performed during Q1 against relevant KPIs.

## Q1 Report

### REPORTED:

- ii. Teaching Excellence Framework (TEF) performance metrics had been released ahead of the development of new provider TEF submissions. In five of the eight metrics the University was placed above the benchmark, with the three below benchmark reflective of the most recent National Student Survey (NSS) assessment of the student experience. As part of the University's response to the NSS, all areas were continuing to work on implementing their respective NSS action plans and these were being overseen at Faculty level.
- iii. The University continued to focus on interventions that would assist in improving its performance across a number of University League table metrics. This included recently submitting 287 academic names and circa 700 employers for the QS academic and employer reputation surveys.
- iv. The KPI related to increasing the diversity of the University's student population (target 25% non-UK) was currently flagged as red at Q1, with the latest performance recorded at 21%. However, this KPI had recently improved with the latest student recruitment intake and it was expected that the KPI would be back on target by next year.

## FC1 Report

- v. *Paragraph redacted due to commercial interest.*
- vi. *Paragraph redacted due to commercial interest.*

### NOTED:

- vii. Performance metrics would change with the implementation of Strategy 2031. Plans were underway for members to focus on the development of the new strategy and future size and shape at Council's March 2023 Away Day.

### AGREED:

- viii. The Q1 and FC1 performance report should be approved.

## 11. 2023 Teaching Excellence Framework Submission – The University Submission and the Student Submission

### RECEIVED:

- i. A copy of the University's TEF submission, together with the Liverpool Guild of Students' submission.

### REPORTED:

- ii. Submission to the TEF was mandatory for all English universities in receipt of student loan funding. The deadline for submission to the Office for Students was 24 January 2023 and the University had submitted through the portal the day before.

- iii. The institutional TEF submission had a maximum permitted length of 25 pages and needed to provide a reflective account under two main headings – Student Outcomes and Student Experience. The OfS provided an extensive dataset indicating the University’s performance in these two areas relative to calculated benchmarks. The submission must contain an analysis of performance in relation to this provided data, and in addition should ideally draw upon other sources of data showing performance and impact.
- iv. In addition to the institutional submission, students were encouraged to submit their own document (maximum 10 pages). This was led by the Guild and their document had also been submitted before the deadline. The Guild President had been part of the University TEF Working Group and the University and the Guild had worked collaboratively and productively together throughout.
- v. Submissions would be assessed in the period February to June 2023 with the result expected in July/August. Following a period of internal review (allowing for challenge to the result if necessary) all submissions and results would then be published in September.
- vi. The rating received would be one of Gold, Silver, Bronze or Requires Improvement and would last for four years.

**NOTED:**

- vii. Student entrepreneurship enhancements would be an area that would be explored further as part of the education pillar of the new strategy.

**AGREED:**

- viii. The submissions were impressive and provided a useful reminder of the excellent work underway.
- ix. The students and staff involved in developing these important submissions should be thanked.

**12. Statutory Pay Gap Report 2022: Gender, Ethnicity, Disability and Sexuality Pay Gaps**

[The Director of Human Resources, Keith Watkinson, attended for this item.]

**RECEIVED:**

- i. The Statutory Pay Gap Report 2022 which outlined the results of the University’s Gender, Disability, Ethnicity and Sexuality Pay Gap calculations, based on the March 2022 snapshot.

**REPORTED:**

- ii. The key results were as follows:
  - Gender: Mean 21.0%↑, Median 16.1%↑, Bonus Mean 45.1%↑, Bonus Median 75%↑

- Disability: Mean 14.5%↓, Median 7.6%↑, Bonus Mean 0%↔, Bonus Median 0%↔
- BAME+: Mean -7.95%↓, Median -11.6%↓, Bonus Mean 10.98%↑, Bonus Median 58.3%↑
- POC: Mean 6.5%↑, Median -0.9%↓, Bonus Mean 19.14%↑, Bonus Median 75%↑
- Sexuality: Mean 5.9%↓, Median 1.2%↓, Bonus Mean 0%↔, Bonus Median 0%↔.

iii. The following recommendations had already been incorporated into the University's new Equality Objectives and Athena Swan Action Plans (and where relevant would be included within the forthcoming Race Equality Charter Action Plan):

- Address imbalance of genders in lower grades (encourage more men into these roles)
- Increase People of Colour recruitment in higher paid grades, as well as lower grade roles
- Increase disability disclosures and use Positive Action statements within recruitment processes/advertisements to encourage more disabled people to apply for higher grade roles
- Increase sexual orientation disclosures and use Positive Action statements within recruitment processes/advertisements to encourage more Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, Other (LGBO) people to apply for roles
- Review Bonus Pay Schemes for Non-Clinical Staff and Clinical Excellence Awards.

**NOTED:**

iv. Revisions would be made to the report in future to streamline it and include more use of graphs/pictograms and an emphasis on actions underway, and also planned, to address the issues identified in the report. Consideration would also be given to the optimum time to review and present this data.

**AGREED:**

v. The Statutory Pay Gap Report 2022 should be approved.

**13. Update from University Safety Adviser**

[The University Safety Adviser, Steve Dunkley, attended for this item.]

**RECEIVED:**

i. A presentation by the University Safety Adviser on key health and safety issues.

**REPORTED:**

ii. The University's health and safety arrangements continued to be centred around:

- A two tier Consultative and Governance committee structure
- A policy and supporting institutional plan (including KPIs)



- HASMAP as the underlying safety management system (with the University having high level accreditation)
  - Senior leader tours/inspections (including Council members)
  - Clear reporting requirements to the Health and Safety Governance Committee (HSGC) (annual Faculty and Professional Services reports)
  - Increased safety resource in Faculties/Central Professional Services areas.
- iii. In relation to the Wood Park Farm fatality, feedback was still awaited from the Health and Safety Executive on action and the inquest was imminent. Remedial action had been undertaken focussing on the transport plan, risk assessments and training. The independent investigation report had highlighted the importance of assurance and visibility.
- iv. During the COVID pandemic there had been a high safety profile but this had inevitably meant that some attention had been diverted away from general systems work. Consideration continued to be given to the impact of there being fewer people on campus as a result of hybrid working and to safety matters associated with home working. There were also some ongoing concerns regarding compliance with health and safety training.
- v. In relation to fire safety, the Fire Safety (England) Regulations 2022 had come into effect on 23 January 2023 and all requirements were in place. A Project Manager/contractor had now been appointed to work on Fire Risk Assessments, Fire Compartmentation and Fire Strategy.
- vi. More broadly in the sector/profession, there was a focus on mental health and wellbeing and social sustainability and responsibility. The HSE 10 year strategy (2022-2032) included an objective to reduce work related ill-health, with a specific focus on mental health and stress.
- vii. Key areas of focus included: building condition; HSGC workshop and reporting; clear hybrid working health and safety plan; empowerment and responsibility; technology drive (SafetyNet, Tio Fire safety system, Safe Zone); statutory compliance control; and oversight of training – management system.
- viii. Council members were expected to seek assurance on: the development of policy, safety plans and key performance indicators; the development and management of risk registers; auditing, training and competence; emergency arrangements; and the safety of large projects and collaborations. Members could help by continuing to be involved in safety tours.

**NOTED:**

- ix. Health and safety updates would be provided to SLT on a termly basis in future and these would provide KPIs and training completion data. Any exceptions would be reported to Council, noting that updates would also be provided in the Annual Health and Safety report submitted to Council.
- x. The inclusion of an annual internal audit focussed on an area of health and safety also provided assurance in this area.

## REPORTS FROM COUNCIL'S COMMITTEES

### 14. Education Committee

#### RECEIVED and NOTED:

- i. A report on the meeting of the Education Committee held on 17 January 2023, covering:
  - Draft TEF Submission (*dealt with as a substantive item by Council – see minute 11 above*)
  - Employability Priorities for the Year
  - Regulatory Changes  
*Changes to the National Student Survey for the 2023 Survey*  
*Office for Students: Student Outcomes (Condition B3): Priority Areas for Assessment*
  - Update on Progress Against NSS Action Plans
  - Liverpool Online Portfolio Development
  - Student Success Framework Update
  - Performance Report.

### 15. Finance and Resources Committee

#### RECEIVED:

- ix. A report on the meeting of the Finance and Resources Committee held on 20 January 2023, covering the following items:
  - Forecast 1 and Quarter 1 Performance Report (*dealt with as a substantive item by Council – see minute 10 above*)
  - Statutory Pay Gap Report (*dealt with as a substantive item by Council – see minute 12 above*)
  - Pension Increases – April 2023
  - Capital Expenditure – Review of Committee Delegated Financial Authority
  - People Spotlight  
*Employee Value Proposition*  
*Implementation of New Staff Wellbeing Strategy*
  - Transparent Approach to Costing (TRAC) Return 2021/22
  - Annual Report on Endowment Usage and Impact
  - Liverpool University Press Annual Report 2022.

#### AGREED:

- ii. The following recommendations regarding pension increases should be approved:
  - A recommendation from the University of Liverpool Pension Fund Trustee Directors to provide a discretionary one-off consolidated increase of 5% to pensions built up before 6 April 1997 in excess of the Guaranteed Minimum Pension
  - Granting a discretionary one-off consolidated pension increase of 5% to the Ex-Gratia pensioners paid directly by the University.

- iii. The new delegated financial authority levels for capital investment should be approved, to bring the University in line with its peers, and to also improve the efficiency of its decision making whilst retaining transparency and accountability. The current and new delegated authority levels were as follows:

<b>Committee</b>	<b>Current Delegated Authority</b>	<b>Proposed New Delegated Authority</b>
Capital Investment Planning Group (CIPG)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Approval of capital equipment cases up to a value of £500k.</li> <li>No authority to approve cases related to land and buildings (refurbishment etc). This means that all such cases are considered by CIPG but then recommended to SLT (if supported) for approval.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Approval of expenditure on capital equipment cases up to £2m.</li> <li>Approval of capital business cases related to land and buildings up to £2m.</li> </ul> <p>CIPG to report periodically to SLT on all approvals made.</p>
Senior Leadership Team (SLT)	Approval of expenditure on projects of a value of up to £1m.	Approval of expenditure on projects of a value between £2m and £5m.
Finance and Resources Committee (F&R)	Approval of expenditure on projects of a value between £1m – £5m.	Approval of expenditure on projects of a value between £5m and £15m.  In addition, F&R to also receive regular updates on the implementation of capital plan and planned pipeline of works, including approvals made at SLT.
Council	Approval of expenditure on value of projects of a value in excess of £5m.  In addition to approving schemes in excess of £5m, Council also receives regular update reports summarising activity taken by F&R on schemes below £5m as part of quarterly reporting.	Approval of expenditure on value of projects of a value in excess of £15m.  In addition to approving schemes in excess of £15m, Council to also receive regular update reports summarising activity taken by F&R on schemes below £15m as part of quarterly reporting.

Financial delegated authority levels only applied to those projects already identified in the Capital Plan. Any projects that could be considered sensitive or contentious should still be reported to the Finance and Resources Committee (and beyond) for approval, even if these projects were lower in value.

## 16. Health and Safety Governance Committee

### RECEIVED and NOTED:

- i. A report on the meeting of the Health and Safety Governance Committee held on 26 January 2023, covering:
  - Heating and Temperature in Buildings: Institutional Approach
  - Wellbeing Annual Report 2021/22
  - Code of Practice on Health Surveillance
  - Update on Institutional Health and Safety Plan: Key Performance Indicators
  - Health and Safety Internal Audit Report
  - Business Continuity Update Report – January 2023.

## 17. Research and Impact Committee

### RECEIVED:

- i. A report on the meeting of the Research and Impact Committee held on 19 January 2023, covering the following items:
  - University's Researcher Development Concordat Action Plan
  - Rights Retention Policy
  - RISE Phase 3 Consultation
  - Progress Towards CREATE Research Ambitions.

### AGREED:

- ii. The University's Action Plan and review documentation for its institutional commitment to the principles of the UK Concordat to Support the Career Development of Researchers (The Researcher Development Concordat) should be approved.

## 18. Senate

### RECEIVED:

- i. A report on the meeting of the Senate held on 25 January 2023, covering the following items:
  - Institutional TEF Submission (*dealt with as a substantive item by Council – see minute 11 above*)
  - Update on Proposal to Disestablish the Department of Molecular Physiology and Cell Signalling
  - Research Publications and Copyright Policy
  - Student Success Boards: An Update on Objectives and Priorities
  - Programme Review Statement
  - Update on Attendance Policy
  - RISE Phase 3 Consultation.

**NOTED:**

- ii. In future, the majority of the business from the Education Committee and Research and Impact Committee would be reported through Senate's report to Council.

**19. Date of Next Meeting**

**NOTED:**

- i. The next meeting would be an Away Day to be held on Thursday 30 March 2023, with timings to be confirmed.